

Scale of balanced scorecard application in evaluating the performance of Tourism firms in Hanoi

¹Duc Dinh Truong, ¹Duc Tai Do, ²Dang Huy Nguyen,
¹Thi QuynhAnh Doan, ¹Quang Trung Le

¹University of Labour and Social Affairs, Vietnam

²Hanoi University of Business and Technology, Vietnam

Abstracts: This study was conducted to identify, evaluate and measure the attributes of BSC which are applied to evaluate performance in tourism firms in Hanoi. Based on literature review and the results of some interviews, 150 questionnaires were sent to tourism firms in Hanoi and were collected in 1 month. However, only 135 questionnaires were satisfactory and included in the analysis. The results of descriptive statistics, Cronbach's Alpha analysis and Independent T-test have identified and measured the current situation of applying the properties of BSC to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi. Based on the findings, some discussion and administration implications on the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate performance of tourism firms in Hanoi.

Keywords: balanced scorecard, application, performance, tourism firms, Hanoi.

JED class: M40, M41, M42

I. Introduction

In Hanoi, there are about 2,396 companies doing business in the tourism sector (<https://www.yellowpages.vnn.vn>). The majority of businesses are small and medium sized. As of June 2019, Hanoi had 3,499 accommodation facilities with 60,812 rooms. Among them, there are 561 rated accommodation facilities with 22,733 rooms (67 hotels rated from 3 to 5 stars with 10,004 rooms, 07 high-class tourist apartments rated from 4 to 5 stars with 1,349 rooms) (Minh Anh, 2019).

By the end of 2018, with a fairly large value of investment in tourism development, the tourism infrastructure of Hanoi has been relatively complete. In 2018, the number of guests welcomed by tourism firms was estimated at 26.3 million, of which international visitors were estimated at 6,005,268 and domestic tourists were estimated at 20,296,000; the total revenue from tourists is VND 77.48 billion (<https://sodulich.hanoi.gov.vn/so-lieu-thong-ke>).

The tourism industry not only promotes economic development but also contributes to expanding cultural exchanges and improving people's knowledge, recovering health, developing human factors, ensuring national security as well as social order and safety. However, under fierce competition pressure, the competition will become more and more intense with the participation of foreign enterprises which have large amount of capital, high professionalism and wide network. The rivalry is happening aggressively on many aspects such as: products, finance, accommodation facility system, human resources, etc. Therefore, tourism firms in Hanoi are in urgent needs of having effective methods to evaluate its performance in order to improve business and development efficiency.

Balanced scorecard (BSC) is a useful tool in evaluating the performance of tourism firms. BSC interprets the strategy, assists the management in strategic communication, helps assess the performance of the departments as well as individuals when implementing the strategy, providing feedback to enhance the strategy (Sainaghi, 2010). BSC is used to interpret strategies, reach customers and new markets, and radically improve the existing processes and capabilities (Park & Hong, 2005).

II. Literature Review

Kaplan and Norton (2001) assert the performance evaluation system that depends too much on financial indicators can lead to the situation in which managers misevaluate the performance of enterprises and can promote behaviors that have adverse effect on businesses. The authors analyze the factors affecting the success of enterprise's strategy implementation then come to the conclusion that: In the enterprises' system of performance evaluation criteria, it must contain the indicators reflecting factors that play an important role in the successful implementation of the strategy. Factors that have a crucial influence on the success of strategy implementation usually include quality of staff, internal business processes and customer satisfaction. From that, the authors propose the use of a performance evaluation criteria system including financial and non-financial indicators that have a strong impact on the successful implementation of business strategy of enterprises that linked together according to the BSC causal relationship.

Jusoh (2008) conducted a survey on the application of BSC of manufacturing enterprises in Malaysia to evaluate the performance of enterprises. It shows the result that about 30% of enterprises use part or all of the BSC to evaluate performance. Many manufacturing enterprises still focus on financial categories rather than on non-financial categories. However, some non-financial categories such as BSC's customer perspective is widely used and is gaining special advantages. The research results also show that the surveyed enterprises all confirmed that financial perspective solely were not enough to evaluate the performance of enterprises and when combined with four perspectives of BSC, the performance of enterprises will be assessed more accurately and thoroughly.

Halabi et al. (2010) collected survey data from 150 leading manufacturing and service companies in Bangladesh to study the application of BSC in performance evaluation. Research results show that companies use all four categories of BSC to evaluate performance, which include: (i) Financial perspective: ROA, ROI, ROE, sales revenue; (ii) Customer perspective: Market share; brand reputation, quality of products and services, customer feedback rate, the percentage of customers who leave the business; (iii) Internal process perspective: Unit price of products and services, punctual delivery time, relationship with supplier; (iv) Learning and growth perspective: The rate of investment costs in new technologies, the proportion of products and services being innovated, frequency of information exchange within the enterprise, frequency of promotion of businesses, frequency of information exchange with cooperation companies. In addition, the authors also affirm that the use of BSC will help businesses improve performance.

In addition, in Vietnam, typical studies on the level of application of BSC used to evaluate performance are:

Ha and Mac (2015) analyze the current situation of business performance of small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) in Thai Nguyen then offering some solutions to improve the business efficiency of those companies, thereby improving the competitiveness of SMEs. The authors argue that the operation of SMEs is assessed on the basis of different indicators, the most important of which are financial indicators including: (i) Return on net revenue (%), (ii) Return on total cost (%), (iii) Labor productivity (thousand dong/year), (iv) Efficiency of capital use (%) and (v) Average laborer salary per month (thousand dong).

Vu (2017), with the research sample of garment enterprises in Vietnam, using qualitative research methods and quantitative research methods, assumes that the application of BSC in performance evaluation is very important and the application of BSC in businesses of different sizes will also be different. The author based on the studie the research of Anand et al (2005) on four perspectives of BSC and the components of those four perspectives to evaluate the performance of garment enterprises in Vietnam.

Up to now, in Vietnam, there have been studies on the extent of applying BSC to evaluate the performance of garment enterprises, small and medium-sized enterprises, hospitals, etc. In tourism sector, there have been researches on solutions to attract tourists, tourists' satisfaction with service quality, factors affecting tourist satisfaction, factors affecting tourists' choice of restaurant, etc. However, the researches still have gap in research methods, research objectives, research samples. Moreover, there are no adequate and large-scale studies on the application of BSC to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi.

By studying previous research and interviewing with experts, the authors build component attributes (indicators) of BSC which are applied to evaluate performance in tourism firms in Hanoi. The study uses a combination of both qualitative and quantitative methods, appropriate research samples with the survey object of chief accountants, general accountants and the board of directors of tourism firms in Hanoi.

III. Research Subject and Methodology

This study used a mixed research method.

The qualitative research method includes four steps: (i) Overview of research materials; (ii) Develop an in-depth interview protocol for experts and conduct interviews; (iii) Establish and develop the scales of BSC which are applied to evaluate performance in tourism firms in Hanoi and (iv) Summarize the level of application of balanced scorecard used to evaluate performance.

Quantitative Research Methodology: A questionnaire was designed with a 5-point Likert scale from 1: "Do not apply ever"; 2: "Rarely applied"; 3 "Little Apply"; 4: "apply quite a lot" to 5: "Always apply".

The method of data collection was accomplished through the survey with a number of chief accountants, general accountants and the board of directors of tourism firms in Hanoi. We sent the questionnaire in the form of Google doc, email, directly deposit at tourism firms in Hanoi, indirectly sent to relatives, etc. After 1 month, we collected 150 votes. After cleaning, 135 votes were included in the analysis. The size of this sample was consistent with study of Hair et al. (2006). Quantitative Research Methodology was conducted with the help of SPSS 23.

Inheriting the results of research by Kaplan and Norton (2001), Park & Hong (2005); Jusoh (2008), Halabi et al. (2010), Sainaghi (2010), Ha and Mac (2015), Vu (2017), we identify attributes (indicators) of BSC which are applied to evaluate performance in tourism firms in Hanoi in Table 1:

Table 1: Attributes (indicators) of BSC applied to evaluate performance in tourism firms in Hanoi

Code	Scale
Financial - F	
F1	Sales growth rates
F2	New service revenue / Total revenue ratio
F3	Profitability growth rate
F4	Return on investment (ROI)
F5	Return on assets (ROA)
F6	Return on equity (ROE)
F7	Return on sales (ROS)
F8	Gross profit margin
F9	Return on costs
F10	Return on fixed assets
F11	Cost reduction ratio
Customer - C	
C1	Number of customer complaints
C2	Time to resolve one complaint
C3	Rate of customers leaving the enterprise
C4	Frequency of customers using customer services
C5	Rate of services provided that are not in accordance with the contract
C6	New customer sales rate
C7	Rate of new customer wanting to return
Internal Business Processes (IBP)	
IBP1	Provide timely service
IBP2	Rate of service that are not up to standards
IBP3	Service cancellation rate
IBP4	Rate of suppliers properly meeting demands
IBP5	Rate of suppliers being a regular supplier for businesses
Learning & growth - LG	
LG1	Rate of workers with post-graduate degrees

LG2	Rate of workers with graduate degrees
LG3	Rate of workers with no degree
LG4	Rate of workers with high professional skills
LG5	Rate of workers wanting to work a long time in business
LG6	Rate of exchange working experience time
LG7	Training expense / Total cost ratio
LG8	Research and development expense / Total expense
LG9	Equipment renovation factor
LG10	New services / Total services ratio

IV. Research Results

IV.1. Descriptive Statistics

Table 2: Respondents by Gender

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Male	59	43.7	43.7	43.7
	Female	76	56.3	56.3	100.0
	Total	135	100.0	100.0	

Table 3: Respondents by Job Description

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Board of directors	53	39.3	39.3	39.3
	General accountants	42	31.1	31.1	70.4
	Chief accountants	40	29.6	29.6	100.0
	Total	135	100.0	100.0	

Information of data collected is shown in Table 2 & Table 3. It shows that among the 135 respondents, about 43.7% were male while the remaining 76 (56.3%) were female. Among the respondents, Board of directors accounted for 39.3%, general accounting accounted for 31.1%, while the remaining 29.6% or 40 respondents were chief accountant.

Next, Table 4, Table 5, Table 6 & Table 7 present the current situation of applying the properties of BSC to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi.

Table 4: Descriptive Analysis of Attributes of the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms: Financial aspects

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
F1	135	3	5	4.13	.731
F2	135	2	5	3.93	.765
F3	135	2	5	4.07	.745
F4	135	2	5	3.96	.845
F5	135	2	5	4.01	.652
F6	135	2	5	4.11	.631
F7	135	2	5	3.93	.749
F8	135	2	5	3.96	.762
F9	135	2	5	4.01	.658
F10	135	2	5	4.08	.744
F11	135	2	5	4.06	.699
Valid N (listwise)	135			4.02	

Scale of balanced scorecard application in evaluating the performance of Tourism firms in Hanoi

Table 4 indicates that the respondents rate the applied BSC to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi: Financial aspects, where eleven (11) attributes were quite high with an average of 4.02 compared with the highest of the Likert 5-point scale. All these eleven (11) attributes were rated at an average of 3.93 or higher.

Table 5: Descriptive Analysis of Attributes of the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms: Aspect customer

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
C1	135	2	5	4.20	.621
C2	135	2	5	4.02	.717
C3	135	2	5	4.10	.656
C4	135	1	5	3.87	1.013
C5	135	2	5	3.65	.925
C6	135	1	5	3.81	.956
C7	135	1	5	3.53	.961
Valid N (listwise)	135			3.88	

Table 5 indicates that the respondents rate the applied BSC to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi: Aspect customer, where seven (7) attributes were quite high with an average of 3.88 compared with the highest of the Likert 5-point scale. All these seven (7) attributes were rated at an average of 3.53 or higher.

Table 6: Descriptive Analysis of Attributes of the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms: Aspects of internal business processes

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
IBP1	135	1	5	3.49	.897
IBP2	135	1	5	3.61	1.007
IBP3	135	1	5	3.53	.961
IBP4	135	1	5	3.59	.980
IBP5	135	1	5	3.80	.953
Valid N (listwise)	135			3.60	

Table 6 indicates that the respondents rate the applied BSC to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi: Aspects of internal business processes, where five (5) attributes were quite high with an average of 3.6 compared with the highest of the Likert 5-point scale. All these five (5) attributes were rated at an average of 3.49 or higher.

Table 7: Descriptive Analysis of Attributes of the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms: Learning and Growth aspects

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
LG1	135	1	5	3.31	.796
LG2	135	1	5	3.57	.787
LG3	135	1	5	3.31	.876
LG4	135	1	5	3.42	.815
LG5	135	1	5	3.47	.904
LG6	135	2	5	3.51	.771
LG7	135	1	5	3.93	.825
LG8	135	2	5	3.64	.860
LG9	135	2	5	3.66	.693
LG10	135	2	5	3.98	.652
Valid N (listwise)	135			3.58	

Table 7 indicates that the respondents rate the applied BSC to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi: Learning and Growth aspects, where ten (10) attributes were quite high with an average of 3.58 compared with the highest of the Likert 5-point scale. All these ten (10) attributes were rated at an average of 3.31 or higher.

IV.2. Cronbach's Alpha

Scale of balanced scorecard application in evaluating the performance of Tourism firms in Hanoi

The extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi has been measured by the Cronbach's Alpha. Results of testing Cronbach's alpha of attributes are presented in Table 8 as follows.

Table 8: Results of Cronbach's Alpha Testing of Attributes

	Scale Mean if Item Deleted	Scale Variance if Item Deleted	Corrected Item-Total Correlation	Cronbach's Alpha if Item Deleted
The extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms: Financial aspects Cronbach's Alpha: .714				
F1	40.111	14.323	.343	.700
F2	40.311	15.186	.372	.703
F3	40.178	15.207	.376	.703
F4	40.289	14.222	.398	.712
F5	40.237	13.570	.459	.669
F6	40.133	13.415	.517	.661
F7	40.319	13.219	.444	.668
F8	40.289	13.431	.392	.677
F9	40.230	13.298	.515	.660
F10	40.163	12.854	.524	.655
F11	40.185	12.913	.557	.652
The extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms: Aspect customer Cronbach's Alpha: .865				
C1	22.98	15.992	.453	.850
C2	23.16	16.177	.335	.864
C3	23.08	15.449	.532	.841
C4	23.31	12.708	.677	.820
C5	23.53	12.863	.739	.809
C6	23.36	12.412	.787	.800
C7	23.65	12.572	.753	.806
The extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms: Aspects of internal business processes Cronbach's Alpha: .911				
IBP1	14.53	11.982	.670	.910
IBP2	14.41	10.318	.868	.869
IBP3	14.50	10.834	.821	.880
IBP4	14.43	10.784	.809	.882
IBP5	14.22	11.532	.697	.905
The extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms: Learning and Growth aspects Cronbach's Alpha: .751				
LG1	32.48	13.849	.531	.655
LG2	32.22	14.114	.489	.662
LG3	32.48	13.087	.595	.639
LG4	32.37	13.951	.495	.660
LG5	32.33	13.087	.569	.643
LG6	32.28	15.786	.304	.710
LG7	31.87	15.534	.317	.709
LG8	32.16	14.894	.301	.696
LG9	32.13	15.266	.348	.687
LG10	31.81	17.883	.323	.748

The results also show that attributes of the dependent variables had a Cronbach's Alpha coefficient greater than 0.6; the correlation coefficient of all attributes was greater than 0.3, so all the attributes of the dependent variables were statistically significant (Hair et al., 2009; Hoang & Chu, 2008).

IV.3. Independent T - test

Scale of balanced scorecard application in evaluating the performance of Tourism firms in Hanoi

Comparing the results of the evaluation of the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi between men and women is shown in Table 9:

Table 9: Differences of the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi between men and women - Independent Test

		Levene's Test for Equality of Variances		T-test for Equality of Means						
		F	Sig.	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
									Lower	Upper
Financial aspects	Equal variances assumed	.891	.347	.663	133	.508	.04221	.06362	.16806	.28364
	Equal variances not assumed			.656	119.014	.513	.04221	.06434	.16962	.28520
Aspect customer	Equal variances assumed	.425	.516	.380	133	.704	.04081	.10732	.25308	.37146
	Equal variances not assumed			.383	127.973	.702	.04081	.10654	.25161	.36999
Aspects of internal business processes	Equal variances assumed	4.620	.033	.049	133	.961	.00508	.10335	.19934	.30951
	Equal variances not assumed			.048	108.453	.962	.00508	.10639	.20579	.31596
Learning and Growth aspects	Equal variances assumed	1.201	.275	1.953	133	.053	.14079	.07210	.28340	.30182
	Equal variances not assumed			1.931	119.176	.056	.14079	.07289	.28512	.30354

According to the results of Table 9,

(i). *Financial aspects*

Sig Levene's Test = 0.347 more than 0.05; the variance between the two female and male is not different. Moreover, Sig value T-Test = 0.508 > 0.05, Which mean there is statistically no significant difference in the level of the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi competence evaluation by workers who have different genders (Hair et al., 2009; Hoang and Chu, 2008).

(ii). *Aspect customer*

Sig Levene's Test = 0.516 more than 0.05; the variance between the two female and male is not different. Moreover, Sig value T-Test = 0.704 > 0.05, Which mean there is statistically no significant difference in the level of the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi competence evaluation by workers who have different genders (Hair et al., 2009; Hoang and Chu, 2008).

(iii). *Aspects of internal business processes*

Sig Levene's Test = 0.033 less than 0.05; the variance between the two female and male is different. Moreover, Sig value T-Test = 0.962 > 0.05, Which mean there is statistically no significant difference in the level of the extent to which BSC is

applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi competence evaluation by workers who have different genders (Hair et al., 2009; Hoang and Chu, 2008).

(iv). *Learning and Growth aspects*

Sig Levene's Test = 0.275 more than 0.05; the variance between the two female and male is not different. Moreover, Sig value T-Test = 0.053 > 0.05, Which mean there is statistically no significant difference in the level of the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate the performance of tourism firms in Hanoi competence evaluation by workers who have different genders (Hair et al., 2009; Hoang and Chu, 2008).

V. Discussion and administrative implications

V.1. Discussion and administration implications on the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate performance of tourism firms in terms of finance

The total revenue from tourists increased from VND 61,778 billion in 2016 to VND 77,480 billion in 2018. The average growth rate of total revenue from tourists in three years (2016-2018) reached 12.1% (Minh Anh, 2019). Besides, the total products and services, including tourism in Hanoi, has continuously increased over the years.

International tourism fair in Hanoi achieved record revenue: Vietnam International Tourism Fair was held in March 2019 at Cultural palace of Vietnamese – Soviet friendship (Hanoi). The total revenue in the first three days of the 18 participating businesses was estimated at 322.3 billion VND, while the revenue was only 245 billion VND in 2018 (Kieu Duong, 2019).

Financial capacity is expressed at the level and rate of contribution to the total product in the area of Hanoi city, the development index compared to other economic sectors in the same area; Total revenue, profit, and investment income (Nguyen, 2017).

Tourism firms in Hanoi area are a bright spot with strong rebound in the socio-economic context of the Capital. Total revenue from tourists continuously increases over the years, tourism firms in Hanoi area contribute significantly directly to the city's GDP, creating jobs for workers.

However, tourism firms have not focused on the maintenance of BSC in their businesses in terms of finance. Therefore, tourism firms should also pay attention to the maintenance of BSC in their businesses with respect to financial aspects, specifically as follows:

Always strive to achieve growth performance indicators;

Take measures to prevent financial risks and exchange rate risk which happen to international tourists and international cooperation.

Take measures to recover liabilities on time from major customers who are under contracts.

Take cost-saving measures, control costs strictly and clearly through internal spending regulations or business regulations.

V.2. Discussion and administration implications on the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate performance of tourism firms in terms of customer

In the 2016-2018 period, the number of tourists coming to Hanoi reached an average growth rate of 10.2%/year. In particular, the growth rate of international tourists coming to Hanoi reached 22.5%/year. Contribution of the tourism industry to the GRDP of city can be considered as a significant initial result for the orientation of developing tourism into the key economic sector that Hanoi city has laid out and directed throughout recent years.

Today, the mindset of "customers is king" still exists in most tourism firms with different levels; customers are one of the criteria for tourism firms to build corporate culture.

Attracting and retaining customers is one of the important goals of tourism firms in Hanoi. Tourism firms have many methods to achieve those goals such as promotions, sending email to customers, etc. to prove to customers that they are valuable to tourism firms.

Customer service of tourism firms in Hanoi nowadays is also paid strong attention to. Service packages that are aimed at creating customer satisfaction, meeting customers' elusive needs, and building a customer service within the company, would surely help businesses have an advantage over competitors in providing customer service.

Tourism firms in Hanoi have gradually classified international customers into different groups of customers such as Japanese groups, Korean groups, Russian groups, European groups, etc. As international customers come from

many different regions that have various distinct cultural features. This classification helps tourism firms have appropriate service processes, creating a sense of closeness and comfort for customers.

Tourism firms have not focused on maintaining BSC in their businesses with respect to customers categories. Therefore, tourism firms should also pay attention to the maintenance of BSC in their businesses in terms of customers, specifically as follows:

Always identify customers as the one who support the entire enterprise.

Always increase the quality of customer service and increase market share.

Always check and review the support, turnover rate of customer, customer care.

Develop relationships with customers to maintain customer loyalty and develop new market segments.

Develop new services to meet the needs of potential customers.

Always be creative and provide customers with the best products and services at competitive prices to increase the market share of the business and increase profits.

V.3. Discussion and administration implications on the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate performance of tourism firms in terms of internal processes

As of June 2019, Hanoi had 3,499 accommodation facilities with 60,812 rooms. Among them, 561 have been ranked as operating with 22,733 rooms (67 hotels rated from 3 to 5 stars with 10,004 rooms, 07 high-class tourist apartments from 4 to 5 stars with 1,349 rooms). The system of tourist accommodation facilities in the Capital with the presence of leading management brands in the world, basically has met the needs of customers; been capable of successfully running many domestic and international events. In fact, international tourists are staying at 2,402 hotels and motels; 10,859 houses for foreigners (houses, apartments); 2,019 non-business houses (relatives of house-owner come and stay during their trip in Hanoi) (Minh Anh, 2019).

Tourism firms in Hanoi in tourism business sector provide products and services to meet the needs of particularly demanding customers - those who have large budget and special high requirements.

The scale of internal process aspects is related to internal communication in tourism firms. However, the internal communication of tourism firms in Hanoi still has many gaps; the widespread dissemination of knowledge about BSC in enterprises has not been conducted regularly; tourism firms have not tracked and evaluated the application of BSC in evaluating performance. Therefore, tourism firms need to widely disseminate knowledge about BSC within enterprises, not only to managers but also to employees. The successful dissemination of built-up BSC to the departments will create a very meaningful awareness for each person. It makes both the board of directors and all employees understand what they are doing and commit to compliance. On the other hand, tourism firms also need to pay attention to the maintenance of BSC in their businesses in terms of internal processes, specifically as follows:

Keep track and regularly review the organization and operation of each department, encourage contributions, comments to further improve the working process of each department;

Apply scientific advances as well as new management methods, deploying and applying BSC in enterprises to create competitive advantages of the company, promote the ability to mobilize and develop facilities.

V.4. Discussion and administration implications on the extent to which BSC is applied to evaluate performance of tourism firms in terms of learning and growing

In addition to the customer care programs, the tourism firms in Hanoi have implemented and completed the training and development programs for employees with in-depth customer care skills in the field of tourism such as foreign language skills (English, Japanese, Korean, Russian, etc.), service skills, listening skills, cultural skills (customs, cross-culture communication, etc.) to better meet the demands of tourists.

Learning and growing are the two contents of human resource management in businesses. One of the most important issues that human resources professionals in tourism firms in Hanoi focus on is planning and implementing strategies for developing human resources, attracting talents for businesses and retain workers.

Tourism firms in Hanoi always focus on improving the quality of human resources; the oriented standards and human resources in tourism firms include: Professionalism, standards of attitude and behaviors towards tourists, work and for people around them, know how to behave flexibly with professional manner and appearance; have high professional skills, really proficient at work, have good communication and problem solving skills; is equipped with the knowledge and understanding of culture, society, history, psychology, language, etc.

Equipment innovation factor is one of those scales of learning and growth perspectives. The facilities and technology of tourism firms is shown through the value of fixed assets and average equipment of a worker (Nguyen, 2017). However, tourism firms have not focused on the maintenance of BSC in their businesses in terms of learning and growth. Therefore, tourism firms should also pay attention to the maintenance of BSC in their internal in terms of learning and growth, specifically as follows:

Enhance the search and treatment for young highly qualified personnel who are well-trained domestically and abroad;

The commendation needs to be timely in order to encourage more contributions from laborers; regularly send qualified employees abroad for training, and regularly open intensive professional training courses;

Encourage employees to closely associate with the company with remuneration policies that are consistent with the annual business results of the enterprise;

Encourage employees to self-study to improve their skills, provide full support or fund for workers to study to improve their professional qualifications;

Award scholarships to excellent students at universities to attract talents;

Build good welfare programs for employees such as: pay a visit, gift family business, organize exchanges for employees.

References

- [1]. Ha, T.T.N., & Mac, H.T. (2015), Solutions to improve the operating efficiency of SMEs in Thai Nguyen, *Journal of Science and Technology, (ThaiNguyen University)*, No 3/2, 125-129.
- [2]. Halabi, A.K., Zaman Khan, H.U., & Masud, M.Z. (2010), Empirical Study of the underlying theoretical hypotheses in the Balanced Scorecard model: further evidence from Bangladesh, *Asia Pacific Management Accounting Journal*, No 5, 45 - 73.
- [3]. Hair J.F, Anderson, R.E., Tatham, R.L., & Black, W.C. (2006), *Multivariate data analysis*. Prentice-Hall, International, Inc.
- [4]. Hair, J. F., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J., & Anderson, R. E. (2009), *Multivariate Data Analysis* (7th ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall International.
- [5]. Hoang, T., & Chu, N.M.N. (2008), *Analysis of research data with SPSS*, Hong Duc Publishing House.
- [6]. Jusoh, R. (2008), The performance consequence of multiple performance measures usage: evidence from the Malaysian manufactures, *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*, No 57.
- [7]. Kaplan, R.S., & Norton, D.P. (2001), Transforming the balanced scorecard from performance measurement to strategic management, *Accounting Horizons*, No 15.
- [8]. Kieu Duong (2019), International tourism fair in Hanoi reached record sales, download from <https://vnexpress.net/du-lich/hoi-cho-du-lich-quoc-te-o-ha-noi-dat-doanh-thu-ky-luc-3902339.html>.
- [9]. Minh Anh (2019), Tourism growth contributes to the development of Hanoi Capital, download from <http://thanglong.chinhphu.vn/tang-truong-du-lich-dong-gop-cho-phat-trien-thu-do-ha-noi>.
- [10]. Nguyen, M.H. (2017), Improve the competitiveness of tourism accommodation businesses in ThuaThien Hue, *Human Resources magazine(Vietnam)*, No 6-2017, 114-120.
- [11]. Park, A.J., & Hong, P.C. (2005), A Study of the Balanced Scorecard in the US Hotel Industry: Strategic Performance Measurement Systems, *Tourism Study Journal*, 207-228.
- [12]. Sainaghi, R., (2010), "Hotel Performance: State of the Art", *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 22(7), 920-952.
- [13]. Vu, T.D. (2017), Applying the balanced scorecard to evaluate the performance of Vietnam Garment firms, *Doctoral thesis*, National Economics University, Vietnam.
- [14]. <https://www.yellowpages.vnn.vn>
- [15]. <https://sodulich.hanoi.gov.vn/so-lieu-thong-ke>